

Proving The Intervention Of Hegemonic Power In The Translation Of Indonesian Literary Works In European Languages

Prasuri Kuswarini

Faculty of Cultural Sciences Hasanuddin University, Makassar, Indonesia

Abstract

Studies found out that globalization gives rise to the hegemony of dominant economic and cultural forces. The phenomenon is also visible in translation. This study aims to examine to what extent hegemonic power exists in the translation of Indonesian literary works and suggest translation methods according to the problems found. The data sources are the English translation of Pramoedya Ananta Toer's *Bumi Manusia* entitled *This Earth of Mankind* and the German Translation of Mochtar Lubis' *Harimau! Harimau! namely Tiger! Tiger!*. This study is qualitative with a translational, postcolonial, and literary analysis approach. The objects of the investigation are changes in the level of words, phrases, sentences, and paragraphs in both translations suspected of representing a hegemonic power. The results show that *This Earth of Mankind* deleted some crucial thoughts of the protagonist and several events describing the nationalism and revolutionary act of the female characters. *Tiger! Tiger!* exposes adjustment of cultural and natural elements into a different standard of belief and value. Based on the results, it is proposed to give attention to the description of the protagonists and all kinds of setting depicted in literary works and transfer them into a target language as close as possible to the reality described in the source text. This study is expected to be constructive criticism for translation practices and voice the injustices that still occur to literary works from non-dominant languages.

Keywords: globalization; hegemony; Indonesian literature; literary translation; postcolonial analysis

1. Introduction

The translation transfers the source language message to the target language (Winiharti et al., 2021). In today's global era, translation is undoubtedly an indispensable tool to facilitate interactions between nations. However, studies show that globalization does not automatically affect the relations between countries equally. The rapid development of information technology has caused the circulation of money and the movement of people to be controlled by the dominant power and led to the emergence of a global culture that threatens local traditions (Rizvi 2007). Consequently,

there has been a dominant economic and cultural influence ruling the world. Pia Mikander recognized this new form of colonialism. Western supremacy is recognized and difficult to avoid, as is the case with the content of textbooks (Mikander 2016). The dominance is also evident in translation studies. Venuti criticized English authority and domestication translation strategy, which eliminates the values in the source language text (Bielsa 2005). Cronin also stated that globalization affects translation, controlled by dominant language, culture, and ideology (Cronin 2003).

The Indonesian literary work translation, specifically *Laskar Pelangi* by Andrea Hirata, won the 'best seller' in 2005, has more information. The novel was translated into English in 2009 with the title *The Rainbow Troops*. The results of the translation analysis showed that the initial translator, the author himself, hegemonized by western perspective and carried out 'othering the self' by dramatizing poverty, reducing the influence of Islam on Malay culture, and highlighting the corrupt nature of the Indonesian government by adding a new chapter on the struggle of a female teacher against a tin company meant to take over the school (Kuswarini, Hasyim, et al. 2020).

Due to the case, further research was needed to investigate how other Indonesian literary works were translated into the European ex-colonial countries' languages. This study aims to identify and map translation problems by considering the power relations and their effects on the messages and values in the source text (ST). The translations of two major Indonesian literary works are the object of the study. They are *Bumi Manusia* by Pramoedya Ananta Toer and its English translation *This Earth of Mankind* and *Harimau! Harimau!* written by Mochtar Lubis and the German translation entitled *Tiger! Tiger!*. The postcolonial approach is considered suitable for this research because it relates to colonized literary works and is translated into languages from ex-colonizers. The mapping results include suggestions that strengthen the concepts of postcolonial translation conveyed by previous theorists and researchers.

2. Literary translation and hegemonic power in the postcolonial era

The postcolonial era occurred when one by one, the colonies became independent from the 1950s. The countries referred to by postcolonial theories are European countries such as France, England, Spain, the Netherlands, etc., which once had colonies in Africa, Asia, and Latin America (Childs & Williams 2013). Various discourses that bring East and West together were viewed critically in this era, primarily how colonial values survive and develop again in the postcolonial period (Aram Ziai 2012, p. 6).

As introduced by Antonio Gramsci, the discursive practices and cultural strategies controlled by specific forces are hegemony, usually not realized by the parties under control. Hegemony is the ideological practice of dominant group power in society, which is organizational, connective, and

non-coercive, as stated by Gramsci (1971), Eagleton (1991), and Adorno et al. (1994). The hegemonic practice is evident today in the form of pop culture domination in Korea. The influence of Korean pop culture is very pronounced, especially among young people in Indonesia. However, research on the phenomenon of boy- and girl-bands shows that Korean youths highly admire American culture. This reality is perceived to be a form of an asymmetrical relationship between Korea and America. The research concluded that K-pop is an active surrogate of the American cultural hegemony (Kim 2017). Cultural hegemony also occurs in other forms of cultural expressions, such as literature and its translation.

Literary work reflects society's life, described by an author using language in various linguistic expression forms. For example, literary works in the postcolonial era use linguistic expressions that imply torture and suffering history (Cavagnoli 2014). These voices convey to the world through authors who use different means to communicate ideas and attract attention. Literary works reliably reflect real issues, such as historical, political, and social facts (Dubey 2013, p. 85). Therefore, the message of a literary work, entrusted to the narrator, character, setting, and plot, through every word, is an essential document that the reader should conceive. In case the reader speaks a different language from the author, translation is needed for bridging. The translation should seek to transfer messages from a source language to a target language and follow the core principles that translators have to be essentially faithful to the ST (Al-Harabsheh 2019). However, as stated by Spivak, the translation practice, especially in literary works, is often a place for power contestation (Cavagnoli 2014).

According to Steven Lukes, power is the exercise of one state's authority over another by influencing, shaping, or determining its ideology (Nabers, 2010). The power intervention referred to in translation is the influence of language, culture, and dominant thoughts, including English, on the translator's perception and interpretation of the translated work. Yajima quoted Tsuda's opinion regarding the hegemony of the English language against international relations as "English hegemony conditions inequality, injustice, and discrimination in intercultural and international communication and facilitated Westernization, specifically US Americanization (Yajima 2015, p. 93)." For example, Westernization or Anglicization occurred in Irish literature, specifically *Nuala Ní Dhomhnaill*, translated by Paul Muldoon. Muldoon tried to shift the expression into standard English to eliminate the Irish rebellion and Catholicism character (Kirkley 2013, p. 288).

Postcolonial thinkers were very aware of this phenomenon, including Sujit Mukherjee, who innovated English with Indian nuances. Negotiations in English, especially in the translation context and other linguistic creativity, such as the neologism's formation, were Mukherjee's attempts to

define postcolonial relations between India and England (Giovanni 2013). Basque ethnic bilingual authors in Spain also practice Mukherjee's work after realizing that translation has implications ethically and politically. Basque writers perceive translation as "a positive agent for exchange and creation, proof of the translation power to build a culture (Ibarluzea 2015, p. 72)." According to Aldawood, translating literary works is essential in shaping different cultural understandings. For instance, a novel is considered a self-representation code and opens a window to other cultures (Aldawood 2017, p. 29). Kirkley calls postcolonial translation a 'subversive literalism' (Kirkley 2013, p. 288). Therefore, explanations in various forms, such as paraphrases, footnotes, prefaces, glossaries, etc., are necessary (Hijjo & Kaur 2017, p. 33). These opinions form the basis for a postcolonial translation method that respects and cares for differences, apart from considering the identity and subject issues (Hu & Shi 2015). The postcolonial translation concept can maintain linguistic diversity and allow languages to build an archive of textual written works (Mühleisen 2010). The mapping conducted in this research contributes to the existing concepts of postcolonial translation.

3. Method

This research applied qualitative methods with a translational and postcolonial analysis approach, as well as literary theory (Hasyim et al., 2020). The data sources include two novels by Indonesian writers and their translations in English and German. The novels include:

Table 1. Source of data

No.	Source Text (ST)/ Year/ Publisher	Target Text (TT)/ Year/ Publisher	Author	Translator
1	Bumi Manusia cetakan ke 34 (2019). Lentera Dipantara: Jakarta	This Earth of Mankind(1990). Penguin Books (1996): New York	Pramoedya Ananta Toer	MaxLane
2	Harimau! Harimau! Cetakanke 8(2013). YayasanPustakaObor: Jakarta	Tiger-Tige(1992) (Bahasa Jerman). Horlemann: Bad Honnef	Mochtar Lubis	Thomas Zimmer

The selection of data sources is based on the authors' national and international achievements.

Pramoedya Ananta Toer (1925-2006) is one of Indonesia's leading writers. Toer had been a political prisoner on Buru Island for 14 years because he was considered a member of the Indonesian Communist Party. While in detention, Toer produced several essential works such as the Buru Tetralogy consisting of 1. Anak Semua Bangsa; 2. Bumi Manusia; 3. Jejak Langkah; 4. Rumah Kaca. Awards that have been achieved include PEN America Center (1988) and Ramon Magsaysay (1995). All of these awards were received when his works were banned in Indonesia from 1998-1995. (<https://www.kompas.com>)

Mochtar Lubis (1922-2004) was a writer, journalist, and translator. Lubis spoke several languages, such as English, Dutch, and German. He worked as a journalist and editor in several leading newspapers in Indonesia, such as the Antara News Agency and Harian Indonesia Raya. Because he was considered too vocal against the Soekarno government, Lubis was imprisoned from 1956-1966. His important works include: Jalantakada Ujung; Perempuan; Harimau! Harimau!. He has received the Main Book Foundation Prize from the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture and the Chairil Anwar Literature Award. (<http://ensiklopedia.kemdikbud.go.id>)

A translational approach compares ST's word, phrase, sentence, paragraph, and chapter with the TT counterpart. Cases are numbered and recorded into a table. The table exposed the syntactical and semantic cases and the elements related to other aspects such as culture, social, politics, etc. Subsequently, data were grouped by looking at the literary elements of character, settings, and events. These three elements are closely related to the ideology hidden in literary work (Malrieu 1999). The character elements to be considered include proper name, address form, and the character's view of life. In the setting analysis, the derived elements studied include place, time, social environment, and culture. Investigation of event elements focused on addition, subtraction or contraction, and deletion. The next step is to apply the postcolonial theories to examine the changes due to the translation of the three elements mentioned. This analysis helps determine whether colonial values intervened in the translation of these works. Literary theory is used to confirm the extent to which translation produces shifts in these three elements.

There are ten representative examples in the translation of the novel *Bumi Manusia* in English entitled *This Earth of Mankind*. Eight (8) representative data were taken from the translation of the novel *Harimau! Harimau!* in German, entitled *Tiger! Tiger!*. Representative data are cases of translation that are considered to contain hidden hegemonic power interventions.

4. Results and discussion

The following shows the mapping of cases found in the two translations of Indonesian novels into English and German. The translation case of each novel varies; hence mapping is based on the dominant cases affecting the character's description, setting, and events.

4.1 Bumi Manusia (This Earth of Mankind)

BumiManusia (BM) by Pramoedya Ananta Toer narrates the love struggle of a young educated Javanese named Minke and a Mixed-blood girl, AnneliesMellema. Their love ended tragically because NyaiOntosoroh, Annelies' mother, was a prominent Dutch mistress. When the Mellema family dispute occurred, NyaiOntosoroh was not entitled to the property of MrMellema, even over Annelies. Based on colonial law, Annelies had to leave the Dutch East Indies (Indonesia), leaving Minke, the husband. Apart from their chaos of love, the tragic story of Annelies' mother, NyaiOntosoroh, also gives a solid colour to this novel, depicting conditions in the Dutch colonial period. NyaiOntosoroh is described as a special concubine because of the willingness to study and work hard, gaining writing, reading, management, and bookkeeping skills of MrMellema's company. However, all the skills and services in managing the master's plantations and farms were meaningless because they were native. Minke, Annelies, and NyaiOntosoroh should give in to the injustice of the colonial system.

BM was published in 1980 and translated in 1981 as This Earth of Mankind (TEoM) by Max Lane. Studies on the English translation of BM generally examined the linguistic elements, as was done by Urip. He found out that the translator tried to maintain the standard form of ST, though the results caused several problems, including meaningless word lines to mistranslations (Urip 2012). Other studies are conducted by: Ulfah, which focused on the translation of negations and their pedagogical implication (2016); by Miranti and Engliana, who analyzed the shift of functional words (2017); and Purwanti and Mujiyanto, who revealed the translation ideology of cultural terms (2019). The missing thing from the studies includes the number of deletions, which have a significant effect on the literary elements, such as the description of characters and events. The following is a discussion about representative examples of deletion.

Table 2. Deletion of character's perspective

Excerpt	ST	TT
1	“...seorangputri yang sangatcantik.” (p. 31) [“... a very pretty girl.”]	Not translated
2	Semuaindah. Dan yang terindahtetapAnnelies. (p. 32)	Not translated

	[Everything is beautiful. And the most beautiful one is still Annelies.]	
	lasepertiseorang guru dari aliran baru yang bijaksanaitu. Beberapa orang guruku yang kranjingan kata modern	
3	sering mendedepankan contoh tentang manusia baru di jaman modern ini.	
	Mungkinkah Nyai mereka masuk ke dalam daftarnya? (p.38)	Not translated
	[She is like a teacher of that new age of wisdom. Some of my teachers who are fond of the dern" often put forward examples of new humans in this modern era. Could Nyai be on their list?]	
4	"Minke," panggil Nyai, "benarkah orang sudah mula bisa bikin es? Es yang benara-benar ingin seperti di dalam buku-buku itu? seperti yang membeku di musim salju di Eropa?" (p. 42)	"Minke," Nyai said, "is it true people can now make ice? Ice that is really cold, as the books say?"...
	["Minke," called Nyai, "is it true that people have started making ice? Really cold ice like in those books? as it freezes in winter in Europe?"]	Not translated
5	Perempuan hebat, nyai yang seorang ini, pikirku. (p. 60)	Not translated
	[Great woman, this Nyai, I thought.]	

The story in BM is narrated in the first person. It means that the narrator characterizes him-/herself through his/her reports and confession (Wellek & Warren 1954). From the reports, we know that the narrator is a young man named Minke. Quotations number 1 and 2 are Minke's commentary regarding admiration for Annelies' beauty. Furthermore, an expression of Minke's admiration for Nyai Ontosoroh, Annelies' biological mother. Minke considered Nyai Ontosoroh to be a modern, forward-thinking woman (excerpt 3), behaving like an educated European who followed developments through newspapers and books (excerpt 4), a great Nyai (5). Minke's perspective about Nyai Ontosoroh is not translated, though this part shows the opinion of an educated native man regarding a woman with the status of nyai or mistress. Nyai is an indigenous woman, a victim of the

colonial system made a mistress by a male colonizer(Thomas 2014). According to Hafiz, Nyai was a woman cared for by a wealthy Dutch colonial or private official (Hidayani and Hardini2016). Although materially sufficient, a Nyai was still looked down upon by the colonizers, who made her a mistress. The same treatment was also received from people who understood that being Nyai was often not the desire of most indigenous women.

Nyai Ontosoroh is described as a great woman because of the desire to study and work hard, gaining the same intelligence as educated European women. These untranslated expressions can be seen as Minke's 'ambiguous' attitude in viewing Dutch colonialism. The beauty of Annelies as mixed blood and being educated in a European way by Nyai Ontosoroh (4) with intelligence is critical (5). Minke admires the Nyai Ontosoroh figure because of European qualities, unlike native women. Also, Minke's admiration for Nyai Ontosoroh implies siding with native women, especially those marginalized by their society and the colonial system. Minke's character thought, and attitude seems ambivalent, caused by his status as an aristocratic and educated young man living between two cultures, Javanese and Dutch. Minke's ambivalence can be understood as a hybridity phenomenon proposed by Bhabha.

To grasp the ambivalence of hybridity, it should be different from an inversion suggesting that originality is only an 'effect.' Hybridity has no such perspective of depth or truth to provide. It is not a third term that resolves the tension between two cultures (Bhabha 2004, p. 113).

Minke is a figure with a hybrid nature. The elimination of several phrases, sentences, paragraphs, or series of dialogues that contain personal views or thoughts distorts Minke's character in TT. Deletions and reductions are also happened to some events in the story, as shown in Table 3

Table 3. Deletion of Events

Excerpt	ST	TT
6	<p>“Sering dokter hewandatang kemari?” akubertanya. “Kalaudipanggil. Setahun yang lalu hampir saban hari, Tuan Domschoor itu. Mama tetaptak mau katakan ramuan yang dibikin oleh perempuan penjual jamu, obat pelawan mastitis.” “Apa mastitis itu?” latakmenjawab. (p. 45-46)</p> <p>[“Often the vets come here?” I asked. “If called. A year ago, almost every day, Mr. Domschoor. Mama still doesn't want to say the ingredients made by the woman selling herbal medicine, a drug against mastitis.</p>	Not translated

"What is mastitis?" She didn't answer]

- 7 Jugadisiniterdapatpekerja-pekerjawanita. Hanyatidakberbajukerja. Here too,
 Orang-orang there were
 memberikantabikdenganmembungkukdanmengangkattanganpada kami women
 berdua. Dan akusendirimundur-mundurmendekatipintu, workers. They
 mendekatiudarasegar. were
 Iamenengokkebelakangpadakudandenganisyaratmenyuruhakumendekat. sweeping,
 Akupura-puratakmengerti. rinsing down
 Sebaliknyaakumulaimemperhatikanparapekerja yang nampakterheran- the pen
 heranmelihatkehadiranku. Merekamenyapu, menyiram lantaikandang, floors, and
 menggosokdengansapu yang sangatpanjangtangkainya. Semuawanita. (p. scrubbing
 46) them with
 [Also, here are women workers. Just not wore overalls. They bowed and very long-
 raised their hands to both of us. And I went back and forth toward the handled
 door, toward the fresh air. brushes. They
 She looked back at me and gestured me closer. I pretended I didn't all seemed
 understand. Instead, I began to pay attention to the workers who surprised to
 seemed amazed at my presence. They swept, splashed the floor of the see me there.
 cage, scrubbed with brooms that were very long stalks. All women. (p.
 46)]

Not translated

8	<p>Banyak pribumi mengimpikan menjadi Belanda, dangadis yang lebih banyak bertampang Eropa ini lebih sukamengaku Pribumi. (p. 97)</p> <p>[Many natives dream of being Dutch, and this girl who looks more European prefers to claim to be a Native.</p>	Not translated
9	<p>Di atasnya berdiri jambang bunga dari tembikar bikinan Eropa. Bunga-bunga anbersebul dalamny dalam karangan yang serasi.</p> <p>Annelies mengikut pandanganku, berkata:</p> <p>“Aku sendiri yang merangkai.”</p> <p>“Siapa gurunya?”</p> <p>“Mama, Mama sendiri.”</p> <p>“Bagus sekali.” (p. 31)</p> <p>[On it stood the flower bead of European-made pottery. Flowers billowed from within in a matching bouquet.</p> <p>Annelies followed my gaze, said:</p> <p>"I assembled myself."</p> <p>"Who is the teacher?"</p> <p>"Mama, Mama herself."</p> <p>"Very good."]</p>	Not translated
10	<p>“Dia tak menyukai Mama. Jugata tak menyukai aku. Dia jarang di rumah. Kan mas sendiri pernah saksikan aku bekerja?”</p> <p>Kudekap tubuhnya untuk menyatakansimpati:</p> <p>“Kaugadisluar biasa.” (p. 95)</p> <p>[“He doesn't like Mama. Doesn't like me either. He is rarely home. Have you ever seen me work, haven't you? ”</p> <p>I embraced her body to express sympathy:</p> <p>"You're an extraordinary girl."]</p>	<p>"Robert doesn't like Mama. He doesn't like me either. He's hardly ever at home. ...?"</p>
		Not translated

Events in a novel are built-in sequences called storylines (Wellek & Warren 1954). Each incident plays a vital role in shaping the story and its implied message. If there is a pruning of events in the translation, it can result in a shallow message. Quotations 7-10 were from the incident when Minke visited Buitenzorg for the first time, the residence and place of processing various plantation products owned by Herman Mellema, Annelies, and Robert Mellema's biological father. Nyai Ontosoroh, with the real name of Sanikem, is the biological mother of Robert and Annelies, who became Nyai of Herman Mellema when only 14 years. Sanikem developed into an independent and confident person after being taught by Herman Mellema to read, write, and learn many things. Therefore, the plantation companies' management gradually came under Nyai Ontosoroh, whose independence characterizes her plantation management and employs many women (Quotation 7). It arouses Minke's amazement as implied in the sentence: "Instead I began to pay attention to the workers ... All women". The emphasis on the phrase 'all women' implies that Nyai Ontosoroh has a progressive view of employing women on the plantations. The phrase also indicates the wish that women can be independent, especially economically, and have self-confidence. However, Minke's amazement was not translated. This moment is critical in BM, showing women's struggle or rebellion during the colonial period, both rebellion against the colonial system and patriarchy (Rahayu et al. 2019).

Although it seems modern and has European taste, it is implicit that Nyai Ontosoroh still firmly believes in Javanese culture, especially traditional medicine (6). Traditional Javanese herbs were used to treat livestock because European medicine was perceived to be ineffective. That quotation also shows the high commitment level of Nyai Ontosoroh and Annelies to their plantation business. They did everything to keep the plantation going.

Quotations 8, 9, and 10 still come from the chapters discussing Minke's first visit to Buitenzorg. Annelies, a mixed-blood girl, preferring to be considered a native (8), and the arrangement of the Mellema family home dominated by Nyai Ontosoroh tastes are admired (9). Quotation 10 hints at the disharmony of the relationship between Robert Mellema and Annelies and their mother. These quotations show that the Mellema family, women's work, and the spirit of being native grows in their souls at the house. These two important things have a weak description in TeoM because they were not translated.

4.2 Harimau! Harimau! (Tiger-Tiger)

This novel narrates the story of seven men who sought resin in the Sumatran Jungle. Three of them were old enough and respected in their village. They relied on each other in their struggle to find resin in the forest but did not escape mutual suspicion. The suspicion happened when a young woman, Wak Hitam's wife, a man considered highly knowledgeable and who lived in the forest, teased them. The thought that some of them had committed indecent acts with the young wife of

WakHitam became a psychological burden for them, especially when faced with the threat of a hungry old tiger injuring them one by one. They believed that sinning was the reason for this disaster.

This novel was first published in 1975 and translated into German by Thomas Zimmer in 1992, under the title *Tiger!Tiger!*. The most prominent case found in the German translation is the shift in depicting the natural and cultural elements, as shown below.

Table 4. Change of Natural Elements

Excerpt	ST	TT
1	Rambut Zaitun panjang, dan amat hitam warnanya, berombak-ombak, terurai sampai ke bawah pinggang. Pinggangnya amat ramping, dan kakinya cantik sekali. Pergelangan kakinya ramping. Kulitnya kuning langsung, dan giginya putih dan teratur. (p. 14) [Zaitun's hair was long and very black in color, wavy, falling below her waist. Her waist was very slender, and her legs were gorgeous. Her ankles were slender. She has fair skin, and her teeth are white and neat]	Ihr langes schwarzes Haar reichte bis unter die zierlichen Hüften. Die Haut an ihren schlanken Fesseln war so braun, wie eine Dukufrucht. Ihre Zähne blitzten weiss, wenn sie lachte. (p. 25) [Her long black hair reached below her tiny hips. The skin on her slender ankles was as brown as a duku fruit. Her teeth flashed white when she laughed]
2	Di atas kita langit luas, dan di malam hari penuh bertaburan bintang, gelap malam lautan bercahaya di sekeliling. (p. 23) [Above us the skies are broad, and at night full of stars, dark by night the sea shines around]	Über den Männern auf See tat sich der weite Abendhimmel auf, voll von Sternen. Die Welt um sie herum wurde vom Meer und der Dunkelheit verschluckt. (p. 35) [The night sky was wide open over the men at sea, full of stars. The sea and darkness have swallowed up the world around them.]
3	Tetapi di sana tak ada pohon dan tanaman, dan tak ada mahluk hutan. Tak ada bunyi-bunyi hutan. Rasanya seperti kosong di tengah laut. (p. 23)	Stille-keine Bäume, keine Pflanzen, keine Tiere des Waldes. Kein Vogelkreischen, Ästeknaken, kein Trompeten der Elefanten, kein

	[But there were no trees and plants and no forest creatures. There are no forest sounds. It felt like it was empty in the middle of the sea.]	Tigerbrullen. Stille, nur Stille gab es auf dem Meer. (p. 35) [Silence-no trees, no plants, no animals of the forest. No screeching birds, creaking branches, no elephants trumpeting, no tiger roar. There was only silence on the sea.]
4	Tetapi di hutan, biar kita di tengah hutan belantara sekalipun, kita dikelilingi oleh pohon dan tanaman, oleh margasatwa dan serangga, oleh yang kelihatan dan tak kelihatan, yang terdengar dan tak terdengar. Rasanya kita satu dengan bumi ini.(p. 23) [But in the forest, even if we are in the middle of the wilderness, we are surrounded by trees and plants, by animals and insects, by what is visible and unseen, audible and inaudible. It feels like we are one with this earth.]	Das Meer schien leer, öde, einsam, anders als der Wald, wo man jeden Moment Fühlte, dass man lebte. (p. 35) [The sea seemed empty, lonely, different from the forest, where every moment you felt that you were alive.]
5	Bunyi air yang menderas di antara batu-batu, hembusan angin di daun, dan jauh di dalam hutan bunyi si amang yang mengimbau-imbau tak berhenti-hentinya, seakan bunyi orang bergendang, amat sangat menyenangkan perasaan. (p. 24) [The sound of the water rushing between the stones, the gust of the wind on the leaves, and deep in the forest, the sound of the Amang calling out incessantly, as if the sound of someone drumming, was a very, very pleasant feeling.]	Das Tiefe Glucksen des Wassers, das leise Rascheln der Blätter im Wind, und tief drinnen im Wald das Zwitschern der Vögel in den Bäumen. (p. 36) [The deep gurgling of the water, the soft rustling of the leaves in the wind, and deep in the forest the chirping of the birds in the trees.]

Quotation 1 is the narrator's description of the beauty of Zaitun, a village girl idolized by Buyung, one of the young resin seekers. Zaitun is considered beautiful in part because of her fair skin

(kuning langsung= yellowish). In the German version, Zaituns' beauty is characterized by very brown skin like a dukufruit. This change is caused by a translation strategy called 'domestication' (Venuti 1995), aiming to bring the story reality closer to the target language readers' understanding and imagination regarding Eastern women's beauty with brown skin. The translation strategy also occurs in several parts of the text.

One senior resin seeker, Pak Haji, expressed personal experiences and views about nature when sailing worldwide (quotations 2,3,4). Pak Haji felt the silence and the sea's beauty (quotation 2) through the choice of silent words that emphasize the element of light (full of stars; the sea shines). However, the light appears only once in the German version. Though Pak Haji thought the sea was beautiful, the forest was preferred. These feelings are expressed through a choice of nouns related to forests, such as in quotation 3, including trees, plants, forest creatures, forest sounds, and quotation 4: wilderness, trees, plants, animals, insects, and earth. The translation of quotation 3 shows the interpretation or intervention of the translator is quite far away by adding elements, not in ST, specifically in the translation of the sentence: "There are no forest sounds" to "No screeching birds, creaking branches, no elephants trumpeting, no tiger roar." Quotation 4 shows the reduction of the description of the forest in ST as a place for plants and animals and other visible and invisible creatures. The sentence was translated to "the forest, where every moment you felt that you were alive." Changes in the description of the forest are also in quotation 5. The clause: "... and deep in the forest the sound of the Amang calling out incessantly, as if the sound of someone drumming, was a very, very pleasant feeling" describes the excitement of the forest colored by the sound of Amang ape calling each other loudly. This is converted in TT to "birds' sound in the trees." Amang is one of the endemic animals of the Sumatran forest, with the Latin name *Symphalangus syndactylus* (<https://repository.ipb.ac.id>). The change hides Sumatra's uniqueness and natural wealth described in ST while closing the opportunity for readers of the target language to get to know Indonesia, especially Sumatra.

The quotations from ST show the feelings of resin seekers, especially Pak Haji, who loved the forest more than the ocean. The forest was various creatures, visible and invisible, and diverse sounds, audible or inaudible. The translated version of these quotations does not show the forest soul as depicted in ST. Ignoring this element is neglecting local people's beliefs about the existence and function of forests. For traditional Indonesian communities, forest is both a material and spiritual existence (Timo and Ludji 2017).

Changes in a character's physical description (quotation 1) and perspective about nature (quotations 2, 3, 4) are a phenomenon of exoticism (Kuswarini, Masdiana, et al., 2020). The term "exoticism" developed in the 19th century and is closely related to the colonialism of European

nations. It is "a manifestation of diversity" and is praised as "alien" cultural elements (Netto 2015, p. 13). However, in the German translation of the novel *Harimau! Harimau!* the difference is not presented as it is. It is made different according to the Western imagination about the East, such as brown skin (1) and tropical forests full of various animals (3). Exoticism is meant to be a form of positive assessment from the West to the East; it is like a judgment based on a colonial measure, which perceives the otherness of the East as a commodity (Netto 2015)."

The translation of this novel in German shows the intervention of the translator's thoughts or understanding of Indonesia in particular, or the East in general. The 'domestication' translation strategy is oriented towards the reader's target language (Yang, 2017). The following quotations show this trend.

Table 6. Change of Cultural Elements

Excerpt	ST	TT
6	Buyung tak tahu apa perasaan Zaitun yang sebenarnya terhadap dirinya. Kadang-kadang Zaitun baik sekali. Jika dia disuruh ibunya ke rumah Buyung membawa kiriman masakan, dan kebetulan Buyung ada di rumah ... (p. 11) [Buyung didn't know how Zaitun felt about him. Sometimes she was very good. If her mother told her to come to Buyung's house to bring homemade food, and by chance, Buyung was at home]	Buyung wusste nicht, was Zaitun ihm gegenüber fühlte. Manchmal war sie freundlich und aufgeschlossen. Wenn ihre Mutter ihr dann auftrag, Buyungs Familie einen Korb mit Früchten zu bringen, und wenn Buyung es war, ... (p. 22) [Buyung didn't know how Zaitun felt about him. Sometimes she was friendly and outgoing. Then when her mother told her to bring Buyung's family a basket of fruit, and when it was Buyung...]
7	„Si Tun sudah gadis benar. Kelihatannya baik lakunya.“ „Ya, sahut ibu Buyung, „dia rajin bekerja di rumah. Diapandai pula menjahit, dan rajin sembahyang dan mengaji. Dia pun sudah sekolah.“ (p. 12) [„Tun is a right girl. She looks good.“ „Yes, said Buyung's mother, „she diligently works at home. She is also good at sewing, and is diligent in praying and reciting the Koran.	„Sie ist schon eine richtige Frau geworden. Wie wohl erzogen sie wirkt.“ „Ja“, hatte die Mutter erwidert, „und zu Hause geht sie ihrer Mutter bei allem zur Hand. Sie ist eine geschickte Näherin, betet eifrig und kann lesen, sogar die Schule hat sie besucht.“ (p. 23) [„She has become a real woman.

She's has attended school. "]

How well-behaved she looked."

"Yes," her mother replied," and at home she helps her mother with everything. She is a skilled seamstress, prays diligently and can read, and she has even attended school. "]

8

Biarpun Talib pendiam, dan selalu memandang dunia dengan mata yang gelap, akan tetapi dia seorang yang berani juga. Pernah ketika orang sekampung berburu babi, dan anjing-anjing telah mengepung babi, maka seorang pemburu datang mendekati babi hendak menombaknya. Dia melemparkan tombaknya, akan tetapi babi dapat mengelak, lalu balas menyerang, tanpa memperdulikan anjing-anjing yang berkerumun mengelilinginya. Talib tanpa ragu-ragu menyerang babi dengan tombaknya, dan menyelamatkan pemburu itu. Sebentar kemudian babi pun hancur dikoyak-koyak oleh anjing (p. 19-20)

Obgleich Talib verschlossen war und die Welt immer in dunklen Farben sah, besass er doch auch Mut. Einmal bei der Jagd auf einen Keiler, war es nur Talibs mutigem Schuss aus nächster Nähe zu verdanken gewesen, dass kein Unglück geschah. (p. 31)

[Although Talib was calm and always saw the world in dark colors, he also had courage. Once while hunting a boar, it was only Talib's brave to thank to, that he shot at close range that no misfortune occurred]

[Although Talib was quiet and always looked at the world with dark eyes, he was a brave man too. Once the villagers were hunting for pigs and the dogs surrounded the pig, a hunter came to the pig and wanted to spear it. He threw his spear, but the hog dodged it, then attacked back, regardless of the hounding hogs around him. Talib, without hesitation, attacked the hog with his spear and saved the hunter. A moment later, the pig was torn apart by dogs]

Quotation 5 narrates the confusion caused by Zaitun's unclear attitude towards Buyung. However, Zaitun is generally kind, shown by bringing the mother's food to Buyung's family. This habit is part of Indonesian culture, making food a symbolic expression in social relations (Melionobudianto 2004). In the German version, 'homemade food' turned into *einen Korb mit Früchten* (a basket of fruits). Sending food or fruits is common in Indonesian and German culture. Sending homemade food means doing something that takes a longer process than sending fruit. It is carried out only at a particular moment and for a valued person. Therefore, the change of 'homemade food' into a basket of fruit reduces the moment's privilege value. Zaitun's mother sends homemade food to Buyung's family as a sign of agreement for their matchmaking.

Another shift also occurred in the word 'reciting' or reading the Qur'an (quotation 6), translated as ... kann lesen (can read). 'Mengaji'(reciting) means reading the Qur'an. In Islamic culture, reciting is a form of preaching through the habit of reading the Qur'an from childhood at home and in mosques (Luthfi 2016). Translating the word 'reciting' into 'lesen'(reading) eliminates the value of Islamic culture long attached to Indonesian society. Even though 'reciting' is reading, the religious content in this activity makes it a routine that Muslims should conduct as a form of manifestation of righteousness. It is different from 'lesen' or reading, which is perceived as an activity related to learning or filling time. A study shows that reading is not Indonesians' culture, which is still dominated by speech culture (Saepudin 2015). Germany is one of the countries with a high reading culture (Rachmawati et al., 2019). Therefore, translating 'reciting' into 'lesen' looks like transferring a German character into Indonesian.

The reduction occurs in quotation 7, narrating hunting pigs and a hunter threatened by the target pig. The sentence describing how Talib, one of the characters in the story, speared the pig and saved the hunter's life. The dogs that were brought to hunt tore up the pig, was shortened to: „it was only Talib's brave to thank to, that he shot at close range; hence no misfortune occurred.“ This shortening avoids descriptions of seemingly brutal hunting events. As a German, the translator likely internalized European law on animal welfare, which reads: "... the killing is under human control, we have an obligation to avoid causing pain, suffering or other poor welfare to the animal prior to death...(Broom 2017, p. 14)."

Table 7 below serves the comprehensive picture of the impact of the translation cases on the literary elements.

Table 7. The Impact on Literary Elements

Source Text	Target Text	Prominent Cases	Impact on literary elements
-------------	-------------	-----------------	-----------------------------

Bumi Manusia	This Earth of Mankind	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Deletion of the protagonist's admiration on the beauty of a mixed-blood girl, Annelies 2. Deletion of the protagonist's admiration on the greatness of a Nyai (a concubine), who act, work, and think like European 3. Deletion of events: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. When Annelies explained that Nyai preferred to use traditional Javanese medicine for curing sick horses b. When Minke realized that all workers in Buitenzorg were women c. When Annelies wanted to be recognized as a native d. When Minke admitted that Nyai had good taste in decorating her house e. When Annelies told Minke that Buitenzorg was run by her mother (Nyai) and herself 	<p>Weakening Minke's character as a hybrid figure with ambivalent thought and attitude</p> <p>Lost messages about:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. believing in traditional values 2. awakening women's awareness of their strengths and abilities 3. nationalism
Harimau! Harimau!	Tiger! Tiger!	<p>Change of natural elements</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Zaitun's skin color b. Different depictions of the beauty of the silent sea c. Addition of animal's voices 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Change of physical description of a character 2. Change of characters perspective 3. Change of

d. Deletion of the sacred nature of the forest	geographical setting
e. Change of the existence of the Amang monkey with birds	
Change of cultural elements	
a. Replacement of hand made food with a basket of fruits	4. Change of social and cultural background
b. Generalization the tradition of reciting the Qur'an with a standard reading activity	
c. Censorship of the description of the traditional hunting method	

5. Conclusion

The analysis of the translation of the novel BM shows deletions as the prominent case. Tables 2 and 3 expose Lane's tendency to omit sections of the ST that may be deemed not to contribute substantially to the content and message. All deleted parts are from the story's opening, which introduces the characters and the settings. As proofed by the analysis, the removal affects the hidden messages or meanings carried by the elements, such as Nyai Ontosoroh as a women's economic driver despite her status as a downgraded woman.

In the German translation of H!H!, the translator made changes in substitutions, additions, and abbreviations from word to sentence level with different meanings than those intended in ST. The people's beliefs, habits, and values, as depicted in ST, are changed and adapted to different standards. This phenomenon can be assumed as an intervention of the translator based on his values as a European.

Perhaps it is too early to judge that there has been an intervention of a hegemonic power in the translation of the two novels in two European languages. But it can still be concluded that the translators have used their power as the one who has the authority to decide what should be preserved, discarded, or changed. They must be motivated by a particular thought that doesn't care

about the right of the source texts to be known, understood, and accepted as much as possible as it is. As observed by Spivak (Spivak 1988), this fact can lead to the suspicion that the subaltern represented by the two novels cannot speak. As confirmed by previous investigations, translators, who are part of the dominant society, take over the right of the STs to express themselves.

Postcolonialists respond to the phenomenon and suggest using local languages with local colors by using paratextual explanations and drawing attention to issues of identity and subject (Mühleisen 2010; Kirkley 2013; Ibarluzea 2015; Aldawood 2017; Hijjo and Kaur 2017). Based on the analysis, it can be suggested that translation should focus primarily on the perspective of the protagonist and the relationship between the characters. The elements of the setting should be presented as close as possible to the description in the ST.

This research encourages translators to become agents of equal rights for all nations, languages, and cultures, thus also fulfilling TT readers' right to get as complete as possible a picture of the message brought by ST.

References

- Adorno, T. W., Dews, P., Benhabib, S., Lacan, J., Althusser, L., Pecheux, M., Abercrombie, N. et al., Therborn, G., & Eagleton, T. (1994). *Mapping Ideology* (S. Zizek (ed.)). Verso.
- Al-Harashseh, A. M. (2019). Self-Translation : A Faithful Rendition or a Rewriting Process ? Haikal ' s Autumn of Fury as an Example 1. 3L: The Southeast Asian Journal of English Language Studies, 25(1), 144–157. <https://doi.org/10.17576/3L-2019-2501-11>
- Aldawood, S. I. (2017). Representing the Other in the Translation of Culture-Specific Elements in Literary Texts : Wolves of the Crescent Moon as a Case Study. *International Journal of Language and Linguistics*, 4(2), 29–40.
- Aram Ziai. (2012). Postcolonial perspectives on “development.” In ZEF Working Paper Series (No. 103; Vol. 103, Issue September). https://www.academia.edu/12888373/Postcolonial_perspectives_on_development_
- Bhabha, H. K. (2004). *The Location of Culture* (Routledge Classics). In *The location of culture*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203820551>
- Bielsa, E. (2005). Globalisation and translation: A theoretical approach. *Language and Intercultural Communication*, 5(2), 131–144. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14708470508668889>
- Broom, D. (2017). Citizens' Rights And Constitutional Affairs Petitions. In *Animal Welfare in the European Union* (PE 583.114). https://www.researchgate.net/publication/315721435_Animal_Welfare_in_the_European_Uni

[on/link/58dea012aca272059aaac6f2/download](https://doi.org/10.1080/10800300776620171292819)

- Cavagnoli, F. (2014). 10 Translation and Creation in a Postcolonial Context. In Simona Bertacco (Ed.), *Language and Translation in Postcolonial Literatures. Multilingual Contexts, Translational Texts*. Routledge.
- Childs, P., & Williams, P. (2013). *An Introduction to Post-Colonial Theory*. Routledge.
- Cronin, M. (2003). Translation and globalization. In *The Routledge Handbook of Translation and Politics*. Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.
- Dubey, A. (2013). Literature and Society. *IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science*, 9(6), 84–85. <https://doi.org/10.9790/0837-0968485>
- Eagleton, T. (1991). *Introduction to ideology*. Verso.
- Giovanni, E. Di. (2013). Translation as Craft , as Recovery , as the Life and Afterlife of a Text : Sujit Mukherjee on Translation in India. *TranscUlturAl: A Journal of Translation and Cultural Studies*, 5(2), 99–115.
- Gramsci, A. (1971). Antonio Gramsci, Prison notebooks (Q. Hoare & G. N. Smith (eds.). Lawrence & Wishart and International Publishers. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10286630902971603>.
- Hasyim, M., Arafah, B., Kuswarini, P.(2020). The new Toraja destination: Adding value 'Toraja coffee' of the sustainable tourism development. *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, 575(1), 012072
- Hidayani, Fika; Hardini, I. (2016). Citra kaum perempuan di Hindia Belanda. *Muwazah*, 8(1), 98–105. <http://e-journal.stain-pekalongan.ac.id/index.php/Muwazah>
- Hijjo, N. F. M., & Kaur, S. (2017). The paratextual analysis of english translations of Arabic media narratives on daesh. *3L: Language, Linguistics, Literature*, 23(3), 21–36. <https://doi.org/10.17576/3L-2017-2303-02>
- Hu, W., & Shi, Z. (2015). A Postcolonial Perspective on the Cultural Translation Strategies—A Case Study of the English Version of Shuihuzhuan (All Men Are Brothers). *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 5(3), 581. <https://doi.org/10.17507/tpls.0503.18>
- Ibarluzea, M. (2015). The Translation Habitus of Contemporary Basque Writers. *Estudios de Traducción*, 5, 59–75. <https://doi.org/10.5209/rev ESTR.2015.v5.49410>
- Kim, G. (2017). Between Hybridity and Hegemony in K-Pop ' s Global Popularity : A Case of Girls ' Generation ' s American Debut. *International Journal of Communication*, 11, 2367–2386. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03007766.2017.1292819>

- Kirkley, L. (2013). The question of language: Postcolonial translation in the bilingual collections of nuala ní dhomhnaill and paul muldoon. *Translation Studies*, 6(3), 277–292. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14781700.2012.756214>
- Kuswarini, P., Hasyim, M., & Husnal Chotimah, I. N. (2020). Othering the Self as a Form of Mimicry in the English Translation of Hirata's Laskar Pelangi. *Journal of Critical Reviews*, 7(19), 1286–1295. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3672945>
- Kuswarini, P., Masdiana, & Chotimah, I. N. H. (2020). Orientalization of Nature in The German Translation of Mochtar Lubis's Harimau-Harimau. In N. Haristiani, Y. Yulianeta, W. Gunawan, E. Kurniawan, D. Darmawangsa, & A. A. Danuwijaya (Eds.), 4th International Conference on Language, Literature, Culture, and Education (ICOLLITE 2020) (Vol. 509, Issue Icollite, pp. 549–554). Atlantis Press. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.201215.085>
- Luthfi, K. M. (2016). Islam Nusantara: Relasi Islam dan Budaya Lokal. *SHAHIH : Journal of Islamicate Multidisciplinary*, 1(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.22515/shahih.v1i1.53>
- Meliono-Budianto, V. I. (2004). Dimensi Etis Terhadap Budaya Makan Dan Dampaknya Pada Masyarakat. *Makara, Sosial Humaniora*, 8(2), 65–70.
- Mikander, P. (2016). Globalization as continuing colonialism: Critical global citizenship education in an unequal world. *Journal of Social Science Education*, 15(2), 70–79. <https://doi.org/10.4119/UNIBI/jsse-v15-i2-1475>
- Miranti, I., & Engliana, E. (2017). the Shifts of Functional Words in the Translation of Toers Bumi Manusia Into English By Max Lane. *Language Circle: Journal of Language and Literature*, 11(2), 127–135. <https://doi.org/10.15294/lc.v11i2.9585>
- MÜHLEISEN, S. (2010). Postcolonial Translation : Encounters across Languages , Cultures , and Disciplines. *Zeitschrift Für Anglistik Und Amerikanistik*, 3, 257–280. <https://doi.org/10.1515/zaa.2010.58.3.257>
- Nabers, D. (2010). Power , leadership , and hegemony in international politics : the case of East Asia. *Review of International Studies*, 36(4), 931–949. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0260210510001373>
- Netto, M. N. (2015). From exoticism to diversity. *Vibrant: Virtual Brazilian Anthropology*, 12(1), 7–36. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1590/1809-43412015v12n1p007>
- Purwanti, S. E., & Mujiyanto, Y. (2019). The Ideology in The Indonesian-to-English Translation of Cultural Terms in Toer's Bumi Manusia. *Jurnal Cakrawala*, 1(1), 6–11. <http://ojs.pusbindiklat.lipi.go.id/ojs2/a006/index.php/cak/article/viewFile/6/4>

- Rachmawati, T. S., Winoto, Y., & Rohman, A. S. (2019). Study on Mapping of Information Literature Culture in South Coastal Communities West Java Province. *Record and Library Journal*, 4(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.20473/rlj.v4-i1.2018.1-7>
- Rahayu, I., Muliawati, H., & Pujiatna, T. (2019). Women's Struggle Against Colonial Imperialism in the Tetralogi Novel *Bumi Manusia* by Pramoedya Ananta Toer. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, 297(ICILLE 2018), 177–180. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icille-18.2019.38>
- Rizvi, F. (2007). Postcolonialism and Globalization in Education. *Cultural Studies ↔ Critical Methodologies*, 7(3), 256–263. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1532708607303606>
- Saepudin, E. (2015). Tingkat Budaya Membaca Masyarakat. *Jurnal Kajian Informasi & Perpustakaan*, 3(2), 271–282.
- Spivak, G. (1988). can the subaltern speak Gayatri spivak (2). *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture London*., 24–28. <https://jan.ucc.nau.edu/~sj6/Spivak CanTheSubalternSpeak.pdf>
- Thomas, J. E. (2014). Cultural Imaginary, the Rule of Law, and (Post-) Colonialism in Indonesia: Perspectives from Pramoedya Ananta Toer's "This Earth of Mankind." *SSRN Electronic Journal*, 18, 101–126. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2523024>
- Timo, E. I. N., & Ludji, I. (2017). Forest in the Imagination of Meto People : Study of Relations between Women and the Forest. *INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF INDONESIAN STUDIES*, 4, 90–107.
- Ulfah, U. N. R. (2016). Translation Of Negations In Pramoedya Ananta Toer's Novel *Bumi Manusia* And It's Pedagogical Implication. *Jurnal Al-Tsaqafa Volume 13, No. 02, Juli, 13 (2)(Juli)*, 25–27. <https://doi.org/10.15575/al-tsaqafa.v13i02.1971>
- Venuti, L. (1995). The Translator's Invisibility: A History of Translation. In S. Bassnett & A. Lefevere (Eds.), *The Translator's Invisibility: A History of Translation (Translatio)*. Routledge.
- Wellek, R., & Warren, A. (1954). *Rene Wellek, Austin Warren - Theory of Literature*. Jonatha Cape.
- Winiharti, M., Syihabuddin, & Sudana, D. (2021). The english Google translation of Indonesian lecturer's academic writing: A preliminary study. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*, 17(2), 706–719. <https://doi.org/10.52462/jlls.49>
- Yajima, Y. (2015). Bridging for a critical turn in translation studies-Power, hegemony, and empowerment. *Connexions I International Professional Communication Journal*, 3(2), 91–125.
- Yang, Y. (2017). Analysis of Foreignization and Domestication in Translation Strategy from Cross-

cultural Perspective. 4th International Conference on Literature, Linguistics and Arts (ICLLA 2017), Iclla, 76–81.

Web references

http://ensiklopedia.kemdikbud.go.id/sastra/artikel/Mochtar_Lubis(accessed on July 2 2021)

<https://www.kompas.com/tren/read/2020/04/30/143823765/mengenang-perjalanan-hidup-pramoedya-ananta-toer?page=all>(accessed on July 2 2021)

<https://repository.ipb.ac.id> (accessed on July 2 2021)